**Historical Theology II:**

**An Introduction to the Pastoral, Sacramental and Spiritual Theology of the Latin Middle Ages**

 **(THE516)**

Spring 2016 (1/21-5/5), Tuesday, 12:00-2:50 PM

Grand Rapids Theological Seminary (Wood Bldg.), Room 104

Instructor: Dr. Byard Bennett

Office hours: By appointment, Tuesday and Thursday 2:50-4:00 PM

Office phone: 222-1568

E-mail: byard.bennett@cornerstone.edu

Teaching Assistant: Seth Stadel

E-mail: seth.stadel@cornerstone.edu

Course Prerequisite: None, although THE515 Historical Theology I is recommended

# I. Course Description and Goals:

This course is intended to help the student reflect systematically and critically upon the major historical developments in Christian doctrine and spirituality within Latin Christendom (Europe and North Africa) between 400 and 1500.

A special emphasis will be given to issues relevant to

* *pastoral* *theology* (e.g. pastoral care, the pastoral office, the nature of sacraments and their relevance to the life of faith) and
* *moral and ascetical theology* (e.g. the virtues and vices, repentance, prayer, fasting, non-retaliation/love of the enemy, suffering for the sake of Christ and the Gospel, the Christian approach to money, power and possessions, and the relationship between the spiritual authority of the Church and the civil authority of the state),

# II. Learning Outcomes

At the completion of this course, having reflected critically upon the assigned readings, you will be required to show that you have developed an understanding of the doctrines and spiritual practices of the medieval church and their relevance to Christian life and ministry today.

Specifically, you will be required to show that you are able to explain

* how the biblical themes of faith, hope and love were systematically developed in Augustine and later medieval writers, being seen as the three divine gifts which fundamentally informed and shaped the Christian life (=the three “theological virtues”);
* the account of original sin, grace and predestination developed by Augustine in response to the views of Pelagius and Julian of Eclanum and how the reception of Augustine’s views in the Middle Ages shaped medieval piety;
* how monastic rules functioned and how they shaped later Christian understandings of what it meant to have a “rule of life and prayer”;
* the biblical teaching on repentance and confession and the various pastoral issues and institutional factors that shaped the development of public and private penance in early Christianity and the medieval church;
* the different positions taken on the relationship between faith and reason in medieval theology;
* the different positions taken on the primacy of the intellect or the will (love) in medieval theology and mystical (apophatic) spirituality;
* the historical development and pastoral significance of “rules for the discernment of spirits” in early Christian and medieval spirituality;
* the similarities and differences between monastic theology and scholastic theology;
* how the scholastic method in theology was used during the Middle Ages to explore and develop the doctrines of the incarnation, atonement and Lord’s Supper.

# III. Required Course Texts

The following may be purchased from the Hoch Book Room, directly from the publisher at the order numbers given below, or from one of the discount online retailers (new or used) listed at <http://www.addall.com> .

--Bruce Harbert (tr./ed.), *The Augustine Catechism: The* Enchiridion on Faith, Hope and Love. Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1999. ISBN 978-1-56548-298-2. Orders: orders@newcitypress.com; webpage: <http://www.newcitypress.com/augustine-catechism.html> ($14.95; $13.46 from Christianbook.com) ($7.99 as a Kindle E-Book or from Google Play)

--Timothy Fry, O.S.B. (tr), *RB 1980: The Rule of St. Benedict in English*, Collegeville, Minn: Liturgical Press. ISBN 978-0-8146-1272-9. Orders: sales@litpress.org; webpage: <https://litpress.org/Products/1272/Rb-1980-The-Rule-Of-St-Benedict> ($2.95; $2.49 from Christianbook.com) ($1.77 as a Google Play E-Book)

--Michael Casey, O.C.S., *A Guide to Living in the Truth: Saint Benedict's Teaching on Humility*, rev. ed., Liguori, Missouri: Liguori/Triumph, 2001. ISBN: 9780764807398. Orders: Temporarily out of stock from publisher but available for $14.50 from Amazon ($9.99 as Kindle E-Book), $15.29 from Christianbook.com or used from <http://used.addall.com>

--George Demacopoulos, *The Book of Pastoral Rule: St. Gregory the Great*, Popular Patristics vol. 34, Crestwood, NY: St.Vladimir’s Seminary Press, 2007. ISBN 978-0-881-41318-2 ($18.00 from <http://www.svspress.com/the-book-of-pastoral-rule-st-gregory-the-great/>; $14.99 from Christianbook.com) ($9.99 as a Kindle E-Book)

--Dennis E. Tamburello, O.F.M. (ed./tr.), *Bernard of Clairvaux: Essential Writings*, New York: Crossroad, 2000. ISBN 9780824525163. Orders:<http://www.ipgbook.com/bernard-of-clairvaux-products-9780824525163.php?page_id=21> ($16.95; $15.26 from Christianbook.com)

--Brian Davies and G.R. Evans, *Anselm of Canterbury: The Major Works*, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1998. ISBN 978-0-19-954008-2. Orders: <https://global.oup.com/academic/search?q=Anselm+of+Canterbury&cc=us&lang=en> ; email: custserv.us@oup.com ($14.95; $9.88 from Amazon; $8.99 from Christianbook.com) ($7.52 as a Google Play E-Book; $6.49 as a Kindle E-Book)

--Simon Tugwell, O.P., *Ways of Imperfection: An Exploration of Christian Spirituality,* Springfield, Ill.: Templegate, 1985. ISBN 9780872431645. Orders: wisdom@templegate.com ; webpage: <https://www.templegate.com/catalog/product_info.php?products_id=154&osCsid=1435adfd5510386c96431ac890777787> ($18.95)

--Julia Gatta, *The Pastoral Art of the English Mystics*, Wipf and Stock, 2004. ISBN 978-1-59244-457-1(Originally published as *Three Spiritual Directors for Our Time,* Cambridge, MA: Cowley Publications, 1986; reprinted by Wipf and Stock under the UK title *The Pastoral Art of the English Mystics*) ($14.40 from <http://wipfandstock.com/the-pastoral-art-of-the-english-mystics.html> )

--David L. Jeffrey (ed./tr.), *Toward a Perfect Love: The Spiritual Counsel of Walter Hilton* (Portland: Multnomah, 1985; repr. Vancouver: Regent College Publishing, 2001). ISBN 1-57383-191-3. Orders: (Ingram/Spring Arbor): (bookstores): 1-800-937-8000; (titles not available from Ingram/ Spring Arbor may be ordered directly from Regent): 1-800-334-3279; webpage: <http://www.regentpublishing.com> ($24.95; $22.46 from Christianbook.com; $21.87 from Amazon).

--Robert Anderson and Johann Moser (ed./tr.), *The Aquinas Prayer Book: The Prayers and Hymns of St. Thomas Aquinas*, Manchester, NH: Sophia Institute Press, 2000. ISBN 978-1-928832-14-0 ($9.95 from <http://shop.sophiainstitute.com/Aquinas-Prayer-Book-The-P449.aspx> )

# IV. Course Assessment

20% Completion of Reading Assignments and Informed Participation in Class Discussion

40% Major Essay: Critical Analysis and Evaluation of Anselm's Account of the Atonement in *Cur Deus Homo* (*Why God Became Man*) (Due 3/29)

40% Final Exam (May 3)

Completion of Reading Assignments and Informed Participation in Class Discussion (20%):

Beginning in the second week of the course, the first half of the class will normally be a lecture and the second half of each class will be devoted to a discussion of the assigned readings. Discussion can enhance learning in a variety of ways--e.g. class members may suggest different interpretations of a text, describe alternative ways of approaching difficult issues, or point out interesting questions that need to be addressed. Class discussion can only achieve these goals when all members of the class have read and reflected upon **all** the assigned readings for that week and can therefore participate knowledgably in the discussion. For this reason, students will be asked to sign a readings completion sheet at the conclusion of the discussion. (The student who has completed 100% of the assigned readings will receive 100% for that week; the student who has completed less than 100% of the assigned readings will receive 0% for that week. Note that this policy will significantly affect your final grade if you fail to complete all the assigned readings on a regular basis.)

Major Essay: Critical Analysis and Evaluation of Anselm's Account of the Atonement in *Cur Deus Homo* (*Why God Became Man*) (15-20 Pages; Due March 29) (40%)

In the *Cur Deus Homo* (*Why God Became Man*), Anselm develops an account of why, in order to redeem humanity, it was both *fitting* and *necessary* for God to become human and die on the Cross (a substitutionary atonement that made reparation/satisfaction for the sins committed by other human beings). Based on the required readings assigned for 3/29, describe, analyze and critically evaluate this account, examining Anselm's conception of

1. rectitude (*rectitudo*);
2. fittingness, unfittingness and necessity and the relation of these to Anselm's assumptions about the nature, order, proper function and final destiny [blessedness/happiness] of created beings);
3. justice (*iustitia*);
4. debt (*debitum*);
5. satisfaction and reparation;
6. the relation between God's omnipotence and the limitations upon God's actions;
7. the necessity of the union of the divine and human natures in one person in order to effect satisfaction (see II.6-9);
8. the relevance of Christ's freely chosen sinlessness to the making of satisfaction (see especially II.10-11,14-15)

*Format and Style Required in the Essay*

You are required to submit one paper for this course.

* The paper should be in the format specified by Kate L. Turabian, Wayne C. Booth, Gregory G. Colomb and Joseph M. Williams, *A Manual for Writers of Term Papers, Theses and Dissertations*, 8 ed. (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 2013).
	+ The *Grand Rapids Theological Seminary Guideline for Papers* (which is dependent upon Turabian) can be found online at <http://portal.cornerstone.edu> >GRTS >All Docs>Information
* The “Citation Help” (Turabian) page on the library website also contains useful resources:
	+ <http://library.cornerstone.edu/content.php?pid=322881&sid=2753960>

*Structure Required in the Essay*

(1) The paper must begin (first sentence of the first paragraph) with a clear and concise thesis statement, indicating precisely what you intend to prove in the essay (i.e., the particular evaluation of Anselm's argument which you wish to defend).

(2) In the next three to four sentences of the first (thesis) paragraph, explain specifically what major arguments you intend to advance in support of this thesis and how these arguments will be ordered and presented in the body of the paper.

(3) Develop a properly systematic account of Anselm's position, explaining in detail

(a) what his major arguments are (i.e. the principal lines of argument by which

 Anselm hopes to establish his position);

(b) how these arguments are related to each other;

(c) which of these arguments seem persuasive and why;

(d) any alternative positions that Anselm considers or addresses in the course of his argument and why Anselm rejects them;

(i) If the alternative position Anselm considers and rejects *were* true, what difference would this make to the practice of the Christian faith?

(ii) Why are the issues that the opponents raise ones that need to be addressed?

(4) What points has Anselm made in this work that are of lasting value to the subsequent Christian tradition and the life of the contemporary Church? What are these and why? Explain and defend your position, developing an argument in support of it.

(5) Explain in a systematic and detailed manner which of Anselm's arguments do not seem persuasive and why. Are there any issues closely connected with the subject under discussion that Anselm either does not address or does not discuss in a sufficiently detailed or systematic manner? If one were to endorse Anselm's position, what would be the limitations of this position? What problems, questions or situations (if any) might be particularly difficult to address? Why? (Develop and defend your position with close analysis and systematic arguments.)

(6) There must also be a concluding (last) paragraph at the end of the paper (typically a mirror image of your thesis paragraph) which summarizes the thesis defended in the paper and the principal arguments advanced in the body of the paper to establish/prove this thesis.

DO NOT regurgitate what is in the assigned texts or simply take over those writers' language, arguments or conclusions.

Instead, I want to know what you think about the issues after having read all the assigned material and spent some time digesting it and critically and synthetically reflecting upon it. Take a position you feel is defensible and, using your own words, give good arguments (developed in sufficient detail) to support it. You will be graded on the persuasiveness and logic of the sequentially developed arguments you present in support of your position.

* Please use inclusive language in writing your essay, e.g. “humanity” instead of “man,” where the question of gender is not explicitly in view.
* Essays that lack a clear and well-defined thesis statement will be returned to the student for revision.
* The essay should be carefully proofread prior to submission so that it is free of errors in spelling, grammar or syntax.
* Essays that do not evidence careful preparation and revision and lack detailed, well-organized arguments will not receive a passing grade. For a detailed description of the criteria by which papers will be graded, see the “Marking Standards” sheet attached as a supplement to the syllabus.
* Further information about how to research, organize, outline and writer term papers can be found in Bennett, “Research and Writing in Theological Studies” (attached at the end of this syllabus).
* **All papers are due at the beginning of class on the due date. No late papers will be accepted; please plan accordingly.**

*Academic Integrity*

Plagiarism and cheating, like other forms of academic dishonesty, are always serious matters. **Any work submitted for this course that reproduces without proper citation material from any other writer (including an Internet source) will result in a failing grade (F) being given for the assignment and the academic dean and faculty will be notified. A second instance of plagiarism during one’s degree program will result in a failing grade in the course and suspension from seminary studies. For further details, please see the “Academic Integrity” section of the most recent version of the GRTS Academic Catalog.**

* **Do not reproduce any written material of any kind (including passages from the required readings for the paper) without proper citation (footnote or endnote), with quotation marks precisely indicating the extent of the quotation).**
* **Do not consult or reproduce any Internet materials when researching and writing the essay.**
* **Unauthorized copying or use of copyrighted materials and/or unauthorized downloading of files can also result in criminal charges and fines. For further information, please see “Copyright, Fair Use and Plagiarism” on Miller Library’s website:**
	+ <http://library.cornerstone.edu/copyright>

**It is required that you submit a copy of your essay electronically, using the “Submit Course Essay” link at the top of the Moodle course page. All essays will be uploaded to Turnitin, an electronic course management database that screens submitted essays for unacknowledged citation of written material from other writers (plagiarism). Failure to submit one’s essay to the site will result in an incomplete (I) grade being issued for the course.**

Final Exam (40%)

The final exam will consist of 10 short-answer questions (60% of final exam grade) and one essay question (40% of final exam grade), which will be written in class (without access to notes or course materials) on May 3.

* For the short-answer questions, you will be asked to define major terms introduced in the course readings, e.g. "apophatic mysticism" or "*anamchara* (give meaning, role and significance)", using 1-5 sentences each (as appropriate for the term being defined).
* The essay question will ask you to describe in detail Thomas Aquinas' conception of transubstantiation and to explain the philosophical background of the doctrine and the relation of the doctrine to the contemporary practice of eucharistic devotion, based upon the class readings assigned for 4/26.

To help you prepare, a copy of the exam will be distributed in class on 4/12.

Since you will have known the specific content of the exam in advance and had nearly a month to prepare, I will expect you to provide comprehensive and well-informed answers to the exam questions, which will be graded quite rigorously.

# V. Technology Policy

In the last three years I have received an increasing number of complaints from students regarding the distractions created in the classroom by other students’ use of phones, messaging devices, and other electronic communications technology for non-class related purposes.

I am sympathetic to these complaints; I also personally find it distracting when students text in class and withdraw from engagement with the class and their classmates to pursue other activities.

Students may not use the Internet or electronic communications technology in class in a manner that is disruptive in the class setting or is distracting to the instructor or to fellow students.

To minimize distraction and to increase classroom participation and engagement, I do not allow the use of mobile phones, PDAs, or iPods during class.

Each of you should use a paper notebook or binder to organize your notes, handouts and assignments for this course. Your desks should be free from any and all electronic devices – including cell phones – during class.

If you need to receive or send communications, please leave the classroom to do so.

If I observe a student receiving or sending communications during class, I will ask them to leave the classroom and, if this behavior persists, the student will be asked to attend a disciplinary meeting with myself and the dean of students to further discuss this issue.

Students who have official documentation from the Learning Center that recommends the use of technology to accommodate verified learning needs can use the specific technology that is required; if this applies to you, please see me to discuss your particular needs (see VI below).

Students who wish to understand and further discuss my reasons for setting this technology policy are invited to read the following articles and to schedule a meeting with me:

<http://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/hot-thought/201007/banning-laptops-in-classrooms-0>

# VI. GRTS Statement concerning Disability Accommodation

Cornerstone University/Grand Rapids Theological Seminary does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, sex, age or disability in any of its policies and programs and will make all reasonable accommodations for students with disabilities in compliance with Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973 and the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990.

The purpose of accommodation is to provide equal access to educational opportunities to students affected by disabilities and the university does not intend that the standards be altered, nor that the essential elements of programs or courses be changed. Students having documented disabilities may apply for accommodations through Student Disability Services (SDS), which is part of the Cornerstone University Learning Center located in Miller Hall on the main campus. Those needing accommodation are asked to notify the professor of this need during the first class.

In the event that students have questions regarding whether they are eligible for accommodations, how they might provide appropriate documentation of disabilities, or how they might handle a disagreement with a professor over questions of accommodation, the Director of Academic Support should be contacted immediately at (616) 222-1596 or via email at learningcenter@cornerstone.edu. Further information about applying for and utilizing accommodations is provided in the Student Handbook and on the university’s website.

# VII. GRTS Statement concerning Email Communication

Email is the official means for communication with every enrolled student. Students are expected to receive and read those communications in a timely fashion. Since the seminary will send official communications to enrolled students by email using their Cornerstone University email addresses (i.e., first.last@cornerstone.edu), students are expected to check their official email addresses on a frequent and consistent basis to remain informed of seminary communications.

Students can access their Cornerstone University email account as follows:

* Go to gmail.cornerstone.edu
* Enter CU username (e.g., n0236522) and password

Students can forward or IMAP their “@cornerstone.edu” email to a preferred address as follows:

* Log into CU email
* Select “Settings” in the upper right hand corner
* Select “Forwarding and POP/IMAP”
* Follow the on-screen instructions

Students are responsible for any consequences resulting from their failure to check their email on a regular basis for official seminary communications.

# VIII. GRTS Statement concerning Student Course Evaluation

In the last week of each resident course, all students are expected to complete a course evaluation (IDEA Form). This paper-based assessment form will be distributed and completed in class. In Ministry Residency, Counseling Practicum and Counseling Internships, and for all online courses, student evaluations will be completed within Moodle (see final week of course in Moodle). These assessments provide an opportunity for students to offer feedback to professors on the quality of the learning experience, feedback that informs future offerings of the course. More information about these evaluation processes will be provided late in the given semester.

# IX. Mandatory Disclosure Statement: Confidentiality and Disclosure

Students may request that information shared with a faculty or staff member in individual settings remain confidential, except under the following circumstances:

* There has been serious harm or threat of harm to self or others.
* There is reasonable suspicion of abuse of a child, elder or vulnerable person.
* There is a court order mandating disclosure of information.
* There has been a dispute between a student and a faculty/staff member and disclosure is necessary for resolution.
* The faculty or staff member seeks appropriate consultation with CU faculty and/or administration.

X. Course Schedule

Date Class Topic

**1/26**

***Introduction:***

* **Review of Syllabus and Course Requirements**
* **Diversity and Pluralism within Later Patristic and Medieval Writers**
* **Discussion of Academic Writing: Thesis Development, Essay Structure and the Conventions of Academic Writing**
* **Introduction to Augustine's Life and Works**

**2/2 Introduction to Augustine's Theology:**

**Augustine's Account of the Three Theological Virtues in His *Enchiridion on Faith, Hope and Love***

Required Reading (145 pp.; complete by 2/2):

--Bruce Harbert (tr./ed.), *The Augustine Catechism: The* Enchiridion on Faith, Hope and Love, Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 1999, pp. 9-135

***\*The Following Required Readings Are Available on E-Reserve through the Miller Library Website\****

--John Cavadini, "*Enchiridion*" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 296-297

--George J. Lavere, "Virtue" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 871-874

--Eugene TeSelle, "Faith" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 347-350

--Tarsicius J. van Bavel, "Love" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 509-516

**2/9 Pelagius and Augustine on Original Sin, Divine Grace and Predestination**

Required Reading (140 pp.; complete by 2/9):

***\*All Available on E-Reserve\****

*I. Pelagius and the Beginning of the Pelagian Controversy*

* *A. Summary of the Controversy*

--Eugene TeSelle, "Pelagius, Pelagianism" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 633-640

* *B. Theological Themes Pertinent to the Controversy*

--J. Patout Burns, "Grace" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 391-398

--Mathijs Lamberigts, "Predestination" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp.677-679

--Marianne Djuth, "Liberty" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 495-498

--idem, "Will" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 881-885

--James Wetzel, "Sin" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 800-802

--Paul Rigby, "Original Sin" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp.607-614

--Alan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., "Traducianism" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, p. 843

--Frederick Van Fleteren, "Nature" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 585-587

* *C. Augustine's Response to Pelagius in De natura et gratia* (*On Nature and Grace*)

--Gerald Bonner, "*Natura et gratia, De*" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, p. 582

--John A. Mourant and William J. Collinge (tr.), *Saint Augustine: Four Anti-Pelagian*

*Writings*, Fathers of the Church 86, Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1992, pp. 3-21 (introduction to *On Nature and Grace)*

--Roland Teske (tr.) and Boniface Ramsey (ed.), *Selected Writings on Grace and Pelagianism*, Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 2011, pp. 319-367, 377-379 (translation of *On Nature and Grace*)

*II. Caelestius and the Condemnation of Pelagianism*

--Mathijs Lamberigts, "Caelestius" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 114-115

--Roland J. Teske, S.J., "*Definitiones*" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, p. 265

--Gerald Bonner, "*Perfectione justitiae hominis, De*" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 646

--Jane E. Merdinger, "Roman Bishops: The Pelagian Controversy" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 728-729

--Mathijs Lamberigts, "Innocent I" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 451-452

--Robert Dodaro, O.S.A., "Church and State: Manichaeans and Pelagians" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, p. 181

*III. Julian of Eclanum*

--Mathijs Lamberigts, "Julian of Eclanum" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 478-479

--Gerald Bonner, "*Nuptiis et Concupiscentia, De*" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 592-593

--Peter Burnell, "Concupiscence" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 224-227

--David G. Hunter, "Marriage" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 535-537

--Gerald Bonner, "*Duas epistulas Pelagianorum, Contra*" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 288-289

--idem, "*Julianum, Contra*" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, p. 480

--idem, "*Julianum opus imperfectum, Contra*" in Allan D. Fitzgerald, O.S.A., *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999, pp. 480-481

**2/16 The Rule of St. Benedict**

Required Reading (complete by 2/16):

--Timothy Fry, O.S.B. (tr), *RB 1980: The Rule of St. Benedict* (Collegeville, Minn: Liturgical Press), pp. 15-38, 45-61, 64, 66-70, 73-80, 85-96 (Prologue + sections 1-7,18-20, 23-25, 27-38, 42, 44, 46, 48, 53-55, 58, 63-66, 68-73)

--Michael Casey, O.C.S., *A Guide to Living in the Truth: Saint Benedict's Teaching on Humility*, rev. ed., Liguori, Missouri: Liguori/Triumph, 2001, pp. 29-129

**2/23 Confession and Penance**

Required Reading (153 pp.; complete by 2/23):

***\*All Available on E-Reserve\****

--Francis J. Hall, *The Sacraments*, London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1921, pp. 211-245 (on the history and general character of penance)

--Sarah Hamilton, *The Practice of Penance, 900-1050*, Rochester, NY: Boydell & Brewer, 2001, pp. 2-7 (“The Tripartite Model for the History of Medieval Penance”)

--Charles F. Kemp, *Physicians of the Soul: A History of Pastoral Counseling*, New York: Macmillan Co., 1947, pp. 26-32

-- John T. McNeill, *A History of the Cure of Souls*, New York: Harper & Row, 1951, pp. 112-134 ("The Celtic Penitential Discipline and the Rise of the Confessional")

--William A. Clebsch and Charles R. Jaekle, *Pastoral Care in Historical Perspective*, New York: Harper & Row, 1967, pp. 56-60, 148-164

--Peter Biller, "Confession in the Middle Ages: An Introduction" in Peter Biller and A.J. Minnis (eds.), *Handling Sin: Confession in the Middle Ages*, York Studies in Medieval Theology II, York: York Medieval Press, 1998, pp. 3-23.

--Edward G. Sellner, *The Celtic Soul Friend*, Notre Dame: Ave Maria Press, 2002, pp. 74-78,147-149,173-174,177,181-195,199-211

**3/1 Pastoral Care and Pastoral Counsel in Gregory the Great's *Regula Pastoralis***

Required Reading (150 pp. complete by 3/1):

-- George Demacopoulos, *The Book of Pastoral Rule: St. Gregory the Great*, Popular Patristics vol. 34, Crestwood, NY: St.Vladimir’s Seminary Press, 2007, pp. 9-25,

 58-61, 74-76, 87-212

**3/7-3/11 Spring Break (No Class)**

**3/15 Bernard of Clairvaux on Loving God**

Required Reading (141 pp.; complete by 3/15):

--Dennis E. Tamburello, O.F.M. (ed./tr.), *Bernard of Clairvaux: Essential Writings*, New York: Crossroad, 2000, pp. 17-157

**3/22 Anselm on the Relation between Faith and Reason and on God's Existence (*Proslogion*)**

Required Reading (67 pp.; complete by 3/22):

--Brian Davies and G.R. Evans, *Anselm of Canterbury: The Major Works*, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1998, pp. 82-122

--Scott Matthews, *Reason, Community and Religious Tradition: Anselm's Argument and the Friars*, Burlington: Ashgate, 2001, pp. 15-39 ("Anselm and Tradition") ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

**(3/24-27 Easter Break; 3/27=Easter Sunday)**

**3/29 Anselm on the Incarnation and Atonement (*Cur Deus Homo*)**

*ESSAY DUE*

Required Reading (157 pp.[includes all readings necessary to write the required essay]; complete by 3/29):

--Benedicta Ward,S.L.G., *The Prayers and Meditations of Saint Anselm*, New York: Penguin, 1973, pp. 221-237 ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--Brian Davies and G.R. Evans, *Anselm of Canterbury: The Major Works*, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1998, pp. 260-356

--G.R. Evans, *Anselm*, Outstanding Christian Thinkers, London: Continuum, 1989 (repr. 2001), pp.71-82 ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--Richard Campbell, “The Conceptual Roots of Anselm's Soteriology” in D.E. Luscombe and G.R. Evans (eds.), *Anselm: Aosta, Bec and Canterbury. Papers in Commemoration of the Nine-Hundredth Anniversary of Anselm's Enthronement as Archbishop, 25 September 1093*, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996, pp. 256-263 ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--A.E. McGrath, “Rectitude: The Moral Foundation of Anselm of Canterbury's Soteriology,” *Downside Review* 99 (July 1981), pp. 204-213 ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--Michael Root, “Necessity and Unfittingness,” *Scottish Journal of Theology* 40 (1987), pp. 216-228 ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

**4/5 Walter Hilton and *The Ladder of Perfection***

Required Reading (172 pp. total; complete by 4/5):

--Oliver Davies, *God Within: The Mystical Tradition of Northern Europe*, rev. ed, Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 2006, pp. 161-163 (Richard Rolle and the background to Hilton's work), 178-185 (Walter Hilton) ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--Julia Gatta, *Pastoral Art of the English Mystics* (Wipf & Stock, 2004), pp. 8-47

--David L. Jeffrey (ed./tr.), *Toward a Perfect Love: The Spiritual Counsel of Walter Hilton*, Portland: Multnomah, 1985 (repr. Vancouver: Regent College Publishing, 2001), xvii-xxvii, 7-27,43-54,58-60,62-65,73-74,80-82,86-87,89-92,99-101,107-109,111-117,120-127,129-132,137-157,159-171,173

**4/12 God's Hiddenness and Self-Revelation in *The Cloud of Unknowing* and in the *Showings* (*Revelations of Divine Love*) of Julian of Norwich**

*FINAL EXAM DISTRIBUTED*

Required Reading (193 pp; complete by 4/12):

--Simon Tugwell, *Ways of Imperfection*, pp. 152-207

--Oliver Davies, *God Within: The Mystical Tradition of Northern Europe*, rev. ed, Hyde Park, NY: New City Press, 2006, pp. 163-178 (*Cloud*), 185-189 (Julian) ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--Julia Gatta, *Pastoral Art of the English Mystics* (repr. Wipf & Stock, 2004), pp. 50-88 (Julian), 91-131(*Cloud*)

--Excerpt from *Cloud of Unknowing* in David Lyle Jeffrey, *The Law of Love: English Spirituality in the Age of Wyclif* , Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1988, pp. 188-196 ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--Edmund Colledge, O.S.A. and James Walsh, S.J., *Julian of Norwich: Showings*, Classics of Western Spirituality, Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1978, pp. 125-151 (=*Showings* [Short text], ch. I-XIV) ***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

**4/19 Mystical Theology and Spiritual Discernment in Jean Gerson**

Required Reading (52 pp ; complete by 4/19):

--Brian Patrick McGuire (tr./ed.), *Jean Gerson: Early Works*, Classics of Western Spirituality, New York: Paulist Press, 1998, pp. 38-52,282-287,334-364***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

**4/26 Thomas Aquinas on Transubstantiation and Eucharistic Devotion**

Required Reading (108 pp.; complete by 4/26 [includes all the readings necessary to write the essay required on the final exam]):

--Michael Dauphinais and Matthew Levering, *Knowing the Love of Christ: An Introduction to the Theology of Thomas Aquinas*, Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 2002, pp. 105-118***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--Mary T. Clark (ed./tr.), *An Aquinas Reader*, rev. ed., New York: Fordham Univ. Press, 2000, pp. 351-352 (=*Catena aurea*), 407-417***\*Available on E-Reserve\****

--Robert Anderson and Johann Moser (ed./tr.), *The Aquinas Prayer Book: The Prayers and Hymns of St. Thomas Aquinas*, Manchester, NH: Sophia Institute Press, 2000, pp. 61-109 (English on facing pages only=24 pp.)

--Brian Davies, O.P., *Aquinas*, Outstanding Christian Thinkers, London: Continuum, 2002, pp. 170-180 ("Prayer and Sacraments")***\*Available on Reserve at the Circulation Desk at Miller Library\****

-- Brian Davies, O.P., *The Thought of Thomas Aquinas*, Oxford: Clarendon, 1992 (pb. 1993), pp. 345-376***\*Available on Reserve at the Circulation Desk at Miller Library\****

--Gary Macy, "A Re-evaluation of the Contribution of Thomas Aquinas to the Thirteenth-Century Theology of the Eucharist" in Nancy van Deusen (ed.), *The Intellectual Climate of the Early University: Essays in Honor of Otto Gründler*, Studies in Medieval Culture XXXIX, Kalamazoo, Michigan: Western Michigan Univ. Medieval Institute Publications, 1997, pp. 53-67***\*Available on Reserve at the Circulation Desk at Miller Library\****

**May 2-5=Final Exam Week**

**Final exam for course=May 3, 12:00-2:30 PM**

**Supplementary Bibliography:**

**Books Recommended for Further Reading after Completion of the Course**

**Historical Background**

--F. Donald Logan, *A History of the Church in the Middle Ages*, 2 ed., Routledge, 2012

--Norman Tanner, *The Church in the Later Middle Ages*, London: I.B. Tauris, 2008

--Carl A. Volz, *The Medieval Church from the Dawn of the Middle Ages to the Eve of the Reformation*, Nashville: Abingdon, 1997

**Augustine on Faith, Hope and Love**

--Augustine, *De doctrina christiana* 1.37; 3.10

--Augustine, *Soliloquies* VI.12-VII.14 (=J.H.S. Burleigh [ed./tr.], *Augustine: Earlier Writings*, Philadelphia: Westminster, 1953, pp. 30-32)

--Augustine, *On Man's Perfection in Righteousness* VIII.19 (Peter Holmes and Robert Ernest Wallis, *Saint Augustin's Anti-Pelagian Works*, Edinburgh: T&T Clark, p. 165)

--Agostino Clerici, *Ama e fà quello che vuoi...: carità e verità nella predicazione di sant'Agostino*, Palermo: Edizioni "Augustinus," 1991

--Norman L. Geisler, *What Augustine Says*, Grand Rapids: Baker, 1982, pp. 201-207 (nos. 642-657,653-665 [selected texts from Augustine on virtue and role of love in ethics])

--Benedict J. Groeschel, *Augustine: Major Writings*, New York: Crossroad, 1995, pp. 153-155

--M.G.St.A. Jackson, "Faith, Hope and Charity and Prayer in St. Augustine" in Elizabeth A. Livingstone (ed.), *Studia Patristica, Vol. XXII*, Leuven: Peeters, 1989, pp. 265-270

--John P. Langan, "Augustine on the Unity and Interconnectedness of the Virtues," *Harvard Theological Review* 72 (1979), pp. 81-95

--idem, "St. Augustine's Vocabulary of the Common Good and the Place of Love for Neighbour," in Elizabeth A. Livingstone (ed.), *Studia Patristica. Vol. XXXIII*, Leuven: Peeters, 1997, pp. 48-54

--Paul Thigpen (ed.), *Restless Till We Rest in You: 60 Reflections from the Writings of Saint Augustine*, The Saints Speak Today, Ann Arbor, MI: Charis/Servant Publications, 1998, pp. 116-129 (selections on love, excerpted primarily from Augustine’s *Homilies on the First Letter of St. John*)

--Agostino Trapè, *Saint Augustine: Man, Pastor, Mystic*, New York: Catholic Book Publishing Co., 1986, pp. 296-306 ("Love, and do what you will")

**Pelagius and Augustine on Original Sin, Divine Grace and Predestination**

--Stephen Michael Byars, “Our Heart is Restless: Augustinian Sexual Ethics and the Catholic Church of the Twenty-First Century (Saint Augustine and Julian of Eclanum),” Ph.D. diss, Univ. of Southern California, 1997 (DAI, 58, no. 05A [1997]: 1755)

--Mathijs Lamberigts, "Some Critiques on Augustine's View of Sexuality Revisited" in Elizabeth A. Livingstone (ed.), *Studia Patristica. Vol. XXXIII*, Leuven: Peeters, 1997, pp. 152-161

--idem, "Was Augustine a Manichaean? The Assessment of Julian of Eclanum" in Johannes Van Oort, Otto Wermelinger and Gregor Wurst (eds.), *Augustine and Manichaeism in the Latin West*, Leiden: Brill, 2001, pp. 113-136

--James B. Weidenaar, "Augustine's Theory of Concupiscence in *City of God*, Book XIV," *Calvin Theological Journal* 30 (1995), pp. 52-74

**The Rule of St. Benedict (Developing a Rule of Life and Prayer)**

--Hugh Feiss, O.S.B., *Essential Monastic Wisdom: Writings on the Contemplative Life*, HarperSanFrancicsco, 1999

--*Word & Spirit: A Monastic Review* 2 (1981) (Special issue largely devoted to St. Benedict and the Benedictine approach to the spiritual life, with a number of fine articles by major writers)

--Adalbert De Vogüé, *Reading Saint Benedict: Reflections on the Rule*, Cistercian Studies Series 151, Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1994

--Esther de Waal, *Seeking God: The Way of St. Benedict*, 2 ed., Spring Arbor Distributors, 2001

--Esther de Waal, *A Life-Giving Way: A Commentary on the Rule of St. Benedict*, Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1995

**Lectio Divina: Spiritual Reading in Medieval Spirituality**

--Stephen Chase, *Contemplation and Compassion: The Victorine Tradition*, Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2003, pp. 63-82

--Duncan Robertson, *Lectio Divina: The Medieval Experience of Reading*, Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2011

--David C. Steinmetz, “The Superiority of Pre-Critical Exegesis,” *Theology Today* 37:1 (1980), 27-38; repr. in Stephen E. Fowl (ed.), *The Theological Interpretation of Scripture: Classic and Contemporary Readings*, Blackwell, 1997, pp. 26-38

**Confession, Penance and Spiritual Direction in the Middle Ages**

*Early Celtic Christianity*

--Edward C. Sellner, *Stories of the Celtic Soul Friends: Their Meaning for Today*, New York: Paulist Press, 2004

*Later Middle Ages*

--Beth Allison Barr, *The Pastoral Care of Women in Late Medieval England*, Boydell Press, 2008 (see esp. 24-29,36,62,76,94-123)

--idem, “Three’s a Crowd: Wives, Husbands, and Priests in the Late Medieval Confessional,” in Ronald J. Stansbury (ed.), *A Companion to Pastoral are in the Late Middle Ages (1200-1500)*, pp. 213-234

--Berndt Hamm, *The Reformation of Faith in the Context of Late Medieval Theology and Piety*, Leiden: Brill, 2004, pp. 123-124, 131-145

--Alexander Murray, "Counselling in Medieval Confession" in Peter Biller and A.J. Minnis (eds.), *Handling Sin: Confession in the Middle Ages*, York Studies in Medieval Theology II, York: York Medieval Press, 1998, pp. 63-77

--Richard Newhauser (ed.), *In the Garden of Evil: The Vices and Culture in the Middle Ages*, Toronto, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 2005

--Lesley Smith, "William of Auvergne and Confession" in Peter Biller and A.J. Minnis (eds.), *Handling Sin: Confession in the Middle Ages*, York Studies in Medieval Theology II, York: York Medieval Press, 1998, pp.96-106

--Anne T. Thayer (ed./tr.), *Handbook for Curates: A Late Medieval Manual for Pastoral Ministry* (translation and discussion of the most frequently printed manual of pastoral ministry in the late medieval Europe, Guido of Monte Rochen’s *Handbook for Curates*)

**Pastoral Care and Pastoral Counsel in Gregory the Great's *Regula Pastoralis***

--Thomas L. Amos, “Monks and Pastoral Care in the Early Middle Ages” in Thomas F.X. Noble and John J. Contreni, *Religion, Culture and Society in the Early Middle Ages: Studies in Honor of Richard E. Sullivan*, Kalamazoo: Medieval Institute Publications, 1987, pp. 165-180

--G.R. Evans, *The Thought of Gregory the Great*, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1986

--J.D. Green, *‘Augustinianism’: Studies in the Process of Spiritual Transvaluation*, Leuven: Peeters, 2007, pp. 35-51

--G. Hocquard, “L’idéal du Pasteur des âmes, selon Saint Grégoire le Grand,” in *La tradition sacerdotale*, Mappus 1959, 143-167

--Bernard McGinn, *The Growth of Mysticism: Gregory the Great through the 12th Century*, New York: Crossroad, 1994, pp. 34-79

--Bernard McGinn and Patricia Ferris McGinn, *Early Christian Mystics: The Divine Vision of the Spiritual Masters*, New York: Crossroad, 2003, pp. 76-83 (popular introduction to Gregory the Great’s account of compunction)

**Bernard of Clairvaux on Loving God**

--Bernard V. Brady, *Christian Love*, Washington, DC: Georgetown Univ. Press, 2003, pp. 125-140

--Michael Casey, *Bernard of Clairvaux: Man, Monk, Mystic*, Kalamzoo: Cistercian Publications, 1991 (book of selections from Bernard’s writings plus six cassette tapes of conferences on the spirituality of Bernard)

--G.R. Evans, *Bernard of Clairvaux: Selected Works*, Classics of Western Spirituality, Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1987

--Étienne Gilson, *The Mystical Theology of St. Bernard*, Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1990 (an older work which is still worth reading in spite of its complexity)

--Jean Leclercq, *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God: A Study of Monastic Culture*, tr. Catharine Misrahi, New York: Fordham Univ. Press, 1961

--Bernard McGinn, *The Growth of Mysticism: Gregory the Great through the 12th Century*, New York: Crossroad, 1994, pp. 158-224

--M. Basil Pennington, *A School of Love: The Cistercian Way*, Morehouse Publishing, 2001 (popular book which tries to show the relevance and implications of Bernard’s teaching on the love of God for contemporary spiritual practice)

--Ray C. Petry (ed.), *Late Medieval Mysticism*, Library of Christian Classics 13, Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1957, pp. 47-53

--Dennis Tamburello, *Union with Christ: John Calvin and the Mysticism of St. Bernard*, Westminster John Knox Press, 2007

**Anselm on the Relation between Faith and Reason and on God's Existence (*Proslogion*)**

--M.J. Charlesworth (tr./ed.), *Saint Anselm's Proslogion*, Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 1965 (repr. Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 1979), pp. 49-99 (detailed summary and analysis of Anselm's treatise, Gaunilo's response and Anselm's reply)

--Gregory Schufreider, *Confessions of a Rational Mystic: Anselm's Early Writings*, West Lafayette, Indiana: Purdue Univ. Press, 1994, pp. 113-148,250-269 (available at Calvin's Hekman Library, call no. B765.A83 P873 1994)

--Simon Knuutilla, “Anselm on Modality” in Brian Davies and Brian Leftow, *The Cambridge Companion to Anselm*, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2004

--Brian Leftow, “Anselm’s Perfect Being Theology” in Brian Davies and Brian Leftow, *The Cambridge Companion to Anselm*, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2004

--Brian Davies, “Anselm and the Ontological Argument” in Brian Davies and Brian Leftow, *The Cambridge Companion to Anselm*, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2004

**Anselm on the Incarnation and Atonement (*Cur Deus Homo*)**

*Primary Sources*

--René Roques (ed./tr.), *Pourquoi Dieu s’est fait homme,* éd. rév. et corr., Sources chrétiennes 91 (Série des textes monastiques d’Occident 11), Paris: Cerf, 2005

*Selected Secondary Literature*

--Nicola Albanesi, *Cur Deus Homo. La logica della redenzione: Studio sulla teoria della soddisfazione di S. Anselmo arcivescovo di Canterbury*, Tesi gregoriana, Serie teologia 78, Rome: Pontificia Università Gregoriana, 2002

--Steven Scott Aspenson, "An Anselmian Theory of Atonement: A Defense of Anselm's *Cur Deus Homo*," Ph.D. diss. Univ. of Iowa, 1996 (repr. Ann Arbor: UMI, 1997)

--David Brown, “Anselm on Atonement” in Brian Davies and Brian Leftow (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Anselm*, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2004

--Richard Cross, "Atonement Without Satisfaction," *Religious Studies* 37 (2001), pp. 397-415

--Paul Gilbert, H.K. Kohlenberger and Elmar Salmann (eds.), *Cur Deus Homo. Atti del Congresso anselmiano internazionale: Roma, 21-23 maggio 1998*, Studia Anselmiana 128, Rome: Centro studi S. Anselmo, 1999

* pp. 221-234: T.J. Holopainen, “Necessity in Early Medieval Thought: Peter Damian and Anselm of Canterbury”
* pp. 473-490: A.A. Schurr, “Methode und grundlegende Argumentation in *Cur Deus homo* von Anselm von Aosta”
* pp. 621-640: J. Houston, “Was the Anselm of *Cur Deus Homo* a Retributivist?”
* pp. 659-672: L.L. Peterson, “St. Anselm on Justice, Retribution and the Divine Will”

--Floyd A. Grace, “An Examination of What Anselm Meant by Necessary Reasons,” M.A. thesis, St. Joseph's Seminary (Yonkers, NY), 2000

--Vicente Huerta Sola, “Libertad, pecado y redencíon en el pensamiento teológico de San Anselmo,” Dr. theol. Thesis, Universidad de Navarra, 1988

--Roberto Nardin, *Il Cur deus homo di Anselmo d’Aosta: indagine storico-ermeneutica e orizzonte tri-prospettico di una cristologia*, Corona Lateranensis 17, Rome: Lateran University Press, 2002

--Philip L. Quinn, "Christian Atonement and Kantian Justification," *Faith and Philosophy* 3 (1986), pp. 440-462

--Stephan Schaede, *Stellvertretung: begriffsgeschichtliche Studien zur Soteriologie*, Beiträge zur historischen Theologie 126, Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2004 (See the beginning of Teil II: Anselm von Canterbury Satisfaktionlehre und das Stellvertretungsmotiv)

**Walter Hilton and *The Ladder of Perfection***

*Primary Texts*

* Walter Hilton, *Mixed Life*, tr. Rosemary Dorward with intro. and notes by John Clark, Fairacres Publication 138 (Oxford: SLG Press, 2001) (a better version of this text than Jeffrey’s; distributed by Liturgical Press)(available at Calvin College)
* Walter Hilton, *8 Chapters on Perfection & Angels’ Song*, tr. Rosemary Dorward, Fairacres Publications 85 (Oxford: SLG, 1983) (available at Calvin and Western Michigan Univ.)
	+ An older, less satisfactory edition of this text is online: Walter Hilton, “A Letter to a Friend of Hearing the Song of Angels” in J.E.G. Gardner (Edmund Gardiner), *The Cell of Self-Knowledge; Early English Mystical Treatises* (London, Chatto and Windus, 1910; repr. Cooper Square Publishers, Inc., 1966; repr. New York: Crossroad, 1981, pp. 51-59 (available at Hope College and Western Michigan Univ.). This older edition is also now available online as “Song of Angels” through Calvin College’s *Christian Classic Ethereal Library* (1997) at <http://www.ccel.org/h/hilton/angels/>
* Walter Hilton, “A Letter to a Hermit: *Epistola ad Solitarium*” tr. Joy Russell-Smith in *The Way* (July 1966), 230-241
* Walter Hilton, “Epistle to a Christian Friend Newly Turned to Our Lord Jesu,” ed. Clare Kirchberger, “Scruples at Confession,” *Life of the Spirit* 10 (1956), 451-456, 504-510
* Dorothy Jones (ed.), *The Minor Works of Walter Hilton* (London: Burns and Oates; New York: Benziger Bros., 1929)
* Walter Hilton, “Treatise Written to a Devout Man” (1910); now available online through Calvin College’s *Christian Classic Ethereal Library* (1995) at <http://www.ccel.org/h/hilton/treatise>

*Selected Secondary Literature*

* Margarethe Hopf, *Weg zur christlichen Volkhommenheit: Eine Studie zu Walter Hilton auf dem Hintergrund der romanischen Mystik*, Forschungen zur Kirchen- und Dogmengeschichte 95, Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 2009
* Henrik von Achen, “Piety, Practise and Process” in Henning Laugerud and Laura Katrine Skinnenbach (eds.), *Instruments of Devotion: The Practices and Objects of Religious Piety from the Late Middle Ages to the 20th Century*, Aarhus: Aarhus Univ. Press, 2007, pp. 23-44
* J.D. Green, *‘Augustinianism’: Studies in the Process of Spiritual Transvaluation*, Leuven: Peeters, 2007, pp. 73-100
* Thomas H. Bestul, “Walter Hilton” in Dee Dyas, Valerie Edden and Roger Ellis (eds.), *Approaching Medieval English Anchoritic and Mystical Texts,* Woodbridge, Suffolk: D.S. Brewer, 2005. (This volume also contains some interesting essays on how to introduce and teach late medieval English mystical texts.)
* Tarjei Park, *Selfhood and “Gostly Menyng” in Some Middle English Mystics: Semiotic Approaches to Contemplative Theology*, Toronto Studies in Theology 84 (Lewiston, NY: E. Mellen Press, 2002)
* Joan M. Nuth, *God’s Lovers in an Age of Anxiety: The Medieval English Mystics* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2001), pp. 77-98
* Gunnel Cleve, *Mystic Themes in Walter Hilton’s Scale of Perfection*, v. 1, Salzburg Studies in English Literature; Elizabethan and Renaissance Studies 92:19 (Salzburg, Austria: Institut für Anglistik und Amerikanistik, Universität Salzburg, 1989; repr. Lewiston, NY: E. Mellen Press, 2001
* idem, *Basic Mystic Themes in Walter Hilton’s Scale of Perfection, Book II*, Salzburg Studies in English Literature; Elizabethan and Renaissance Studies 92:19:2 (Salzburg, Austria: Institut für Anglistik und Amerikanistik, Universität Salzburg, 1994) (sequel to previous volume; to be reprinted by E. Mellen?)
* John Clark, “Confession and Re-formation: Walton Hilton’s Sacramental Theology” in David Brown and Ann Loades, *Christ: The Sacramental Word*, London: SPCK, 1996 (available at Calvin)
* Gretchen Ruth Tjader, “Contemplation and the States of Life in Walter Hilton,” M.A. thesis, Univ. of Miami, 1995.
* David L. Jeffrey, “Proving the Spirit of Christ: Walter Hilton’s Acid Test” in J.I. Packer and Loren Wilkinson (eds.), *Alive to God: Studies in Spirituality Presented to James Houston* (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1992; repr. Vancouver, B.C.: Regent College Pub., 2002)
* Jordan Aumann, “The English Mystics: An Introduction to Their Lives & Writings,” Modern Cassette Library (Notre Dame, IN: Ave Maria Press, 1983) (3 sound cassettes, 250 min.: 1. Richard Rolle, Walter Hilton—2. Julian of Norwich, Margery Kempe—3. The Cloud of Unknowing)
* M.L. del Mastro, “Walter Hilton’s *Scala perfectionis*: A Circular Stairway” Leonard J. Bowman, *Itinerarium, the Idea of a Journey: A Collection of Papers Given at the Fifteenth International Congress on Medieval Studies, Kalamazoo, Michigan, May 1980*, Salzburg Studies in English Literature; Elizabethan & Renaissance Studies 92:9(Salzburg: Institut für Anglistik und Amerikanistik, Universität Salzburg, 1983) (available at Western Michigan University)
* David G. Kennedy, *The Incarnation and Hilton’s Spirituality*, Salzburg Studies in English Literature; Elizabethan & Renaissance Studies 92:3 9(Salzburg: Institut für Anglistik und Amerikanistik, Universität Salzburg, 1982, © 1984)
* Joseph Milosh, *The Scale of Perfection and English Mystical Tradition* (Madison, WI: Univ. of Wisconsin Press, 1966)
* Martin Thornton, *English Spirituality: An Outline of Ascetical Theology according to the English Pastoral Tradition*, London: SPCK, 1963, pp. 176-200
* Alfred C. Hughes, *Walter Hilton's Direction to Contemplatives* (Rome: Pontifical Gregorian University, 1962)
* Gerard Sitwell, "Contemplation in 'The Scale of Perfection,'" *Downside Review* 67 (1949), pp. 276-290; 68 (1949-1950), pp. 21-34; (1950), 271-289
* Helen Gardner, "Walter Hilton and the Mystical Tradition in England," *Essays and Studies* 22 (1937), pp. 103-127

**God's Hiddenness and Self-Revelation in *The Cloud of Unknowing* and in the *Showings* (*Revelations of Divine Love*) of Julian of Norwich**

*Cloud of Unknowing*

--*A Letter of Private Direction by the Author of the Cloud of Unknowing*, tr. James Walsh, Springfield, IL: Templegate, 1965 (nice pocket edition)

--Kent Emery, Jr., “*The Cloud of Unknowing* and *Mystica Theologia*,” in E. Rozanne Elder (ed.), *The Spirituality of Western Christendom II: The Roots of the Modern Christian Tradition*, Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1984, 46-70, 303-309; repr. in Kent Emery, Jr., *Monastic, Scholastic and Mystical Theologies from the Later Middle Ages*, Variorum, 1996

--Andrew Louth, *The Origins of the Christian Mystical Tradition*, 2 ed., Oxford Univ. Press, 2007 (discusses the apophatic theology of earlier Christian Platonism, to which the author of the *Cloud of Unknowing* was indebted)

--Joan M. Nuth, *God’s Lovers in an Age of Anxiety: The Medieval English Mystics* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2001), pp. 56-76

--Alain Sainte-Marie, *Le nuage de l’inconnaissance*, Paris: Cerf, 2004

--Denys Turner, *The Darkness of God: Negativity in Christian Mysticism*, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1998

*Julian of Norwich*

* *Primary Texts*

--Edmund Colledge, O.S.A. and James Walsh, S.J., *Julian of Norwich: Showings*, Classics of Western Spirituality, Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1978, pp. 175-189,193-199,201-205,207-215,224-228,229-236,238-247,255-295,297-303,305-310,318-323,326-328,329-332,335-336,342-343) (=*Showings* [Long text], ch. 1-7,10-11,13-15,17-21,27-29,31-34,36-40,44-58,60-62,64-65,70-73,75,77,80,86)

--Denise N. Baker, *The Showings of Julian of Norwich*, Norton Critical Edition, New York: W.W. Norton, 2005

--Nicholas Watson and Jacqueline Jenkins (eds.), *The Writings of Julian of Norwich: A Vision Showed to a Devout Woman and a Revelation of Love*, Pennsylvania State Univ. Press, 2006

* *Selected Secondary Literature*

--Denise N. Baker, “The Privity of the Passion” in Anne Clark Bartlett and Thomas H. Bestul (eds.) *Cultures of Piety: Medieval English Devotional Literature in Translation*, Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1999, pp. 85-106 (looks at affective meditation on the suffering of Christ in English vernacular texts of the fourteenth century)

--Bernard V. Brady, *Christian Love*, Washington, DC: Georgetown Univ. Press, 2003, pp. 146-150

--Jennifer Bryan, *Looking Inward: Devotional Reading and the Private Self in Late Medieval England*, Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2008 (on affective meditation on the passion in the fourteenth century English literature, see pp. 105-144; on Julian’s relation to this tradition, see pp. 145-175)

--Kerrie Hide, *Gifted Origins to Graced Fulfillment: The Soteriology of Julian of Norwich*, Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2001 (available in Calvin's Hekman Library call no. BT 752.H53 2001)

--Grace Jantzen, *Julian of Norwich: Mystic and Theologian*, new ed., Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 2000

--Henning Laugerud and Laura Katrine Skinnenbach (eds.), *Instruments of Devotion: The Practices and Objects of Religious Piety from the Late Middle Ages to the 20th Century*, Aarhus: Aarhus Univ. Press, 2007 (the essays on pp. 173-188 and 189-207 discuss seeing as knowing and the role of images and visions in late medieval devotion, providing a background for understanding Julian in her historical context)

--Jane Ellen McAvoy, *The Satisfied Life: Medieval Women Mystics on Atonement*, Pilgrim Press, 2000

--Sarah McNamer, *Affective Meditation and the Invention of Medieval Compassion*, Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2010 (see esp. pp. 41-57, 86-115, 174-206, 219-225, 236-245, 262-269 for discussion that helps to understand Julian in her historical context)

--Paul Mommaers, *The Riddle of Christian Mystical Experience: The Role of the Humanity of Jesus*, Louvain Theological and Pastoral Monographs 29, Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 2003

--Barbara Newman, “What Did It Mean to Say, ‘I Saw’? The Clash between Theory and Practice in Medieval Visionary Culture,” *Speculum* 80 (2005): 1-43 (interesting as background to understand and interpret Julian)

--Joan M. Nuth, *God’s Lovers in an Age of Anxiety: The Medieval English Mystics* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2001), pp. 99-120

--Anne Savage and David Wesley, "Julian of Norwich," Mystic Women of the Middle Ages, Princeton, NJ: Films for the Humanities and Sciences, 2000 (FFH 11058) (24 min. videotape giving a concise overview of Julian's life, times and writings; available at Calvin's Hekman Library call no. BV 5095.J84 J89 2000)

--Philip Sheldrake, *Spirituality and Theology: Christian Living and the Doctrine of God* (London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1998), pp. 99-128 (ch. 4: "A Practical Theology of the Trinity: Julian of Norwich")

--Martin Thornton, *English Spirituality: An Outline of Ascetical Theology according to the English Pastoral Tradition*, London: SPCK, 1963, pp. 201-217

* *Recent Editions of Julian's Showings Designed for Devotional Use (Prayer and Meditation)*

--Ritamary Bradley (ed./tr.), *Praying with Julian of Norwich: Selections from "A Revelation of Love"*, Twenty-Third Publications, 1995 (includes helpful commentary by Bradley, professor emeritus of St. Ambrose College in Iowa and co-founder of *The Mystics Quarterly*, which contributed much to the study of the late medieval English mystics)

--Father John-Julian, O.J.N (John Matarazzo) (ed./tr.), *A Lesson of Love: The Revelations of Julian of Norwich*, iUniverse.com, 2003 (order from Amazon.com or The Order of Julian of Norwich, 2812 Summit Ave., Waukesha, WI 53188)(This edition is in sense-line format and divided into short daily readings)

--Julia Bolton Holloway (ed./tr.), *Showing of Love: Julian of Norwich*, Liturgical Press, 2003

**Mystical Theology and Spiritual Discernment in Jean Gerson and Other Writers of the Late Middle Ages**

*Gerson on Mystical Theology*

--D. Catherine Brown, *Pastor and Laity in the Theology of Jean Gerson*, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press, 1987 (repr. 2007), pp. 171-208

--Jeffrey Fisher, “Gerson’s Mystical Theology: A New Profile of Its Evolution,” in Brian Patrick McGuire (ed.), *A Companion to John Gerson*, Leiden: Brill, 2006, pp. 205-248

--Valerio Lazzeri, *Teologia mistica e teologia scolastica: l’esperienza spirituale come problema teologico in Giovanni Gerson*, Dissertatio Series Romana 8, Rome: Pontificio seminario lombardo, 1994

--Yelena Mazour-Matusevich, *Le siècle d’or de la mystique française: un autre regard. Étude de la literature spirituelle de Jean Gerson (1363—1429) à Jacques Lefèvre d’Étaples (1450-1537)*, Collection Fides Nostra 2, Milan: Archè, 2004

--Kenneth N. Pearson, “‘Faith Seeking Mystical Understanding’: Jean Gerson’s Reform of Scholastic Theology in His Early Works *Against the Curiosity of Scholars* (1402) and *On Speculative Mystical Theology* (1402-1403), to Which is Appended a Working Translation of *De mystica theologia speculativa* (Considerations 28-34),” M.C.S. thesis, Regent College, 1997 (available from the Theological Research Exchange Network, #048-0262 at <http://www.tren.com>)

--David Schmiel, Via propria *and* Via mystica *in the Theology of Jean le Charlier de Gerson*, Graduate Study No. X (School for Graduate Studies, Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, MO), St. Louis: Oliver Slave, 1969

--Of related interest:

Isabelle Fabre, *La doctrine du chant du coeur de Jean Gerson: edition critique, traduction et commentaire du “Tractatus de canticis” et du “Canticordium au pélerin,”* Publications romanes et françaises 235,Genève: Librairie Droz, 2005

--Christopher M. Bellitto, *Nicolas de Clamanges: Spirituality, Personal Reform, and Pastoral Renewal on the Eve of the Reformations*, Washington, DC: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 2001, pp. 59-90, 111-126 (the proposals for personal and ecclesial spiritual renewal and the reformation of scholastic theology by a friend and sympathizer of Gerson)

*Gerson on Discernment of Spirits*

--P. Boland, *The Concept of* Discretio spirituum *in John Gerson's* De probatione spirituum *and* De distinctione verarum visionum a falsis, Washington, 1959

--Dyan Elliot, “Seeing Double: John Gerson, the Discernment of Spirits, and Joan of Arc,” *The American Historical Review* 107:1 (2002): 26-54

--Brian Patrick McGuire, *Jean Gerson and the Last Medieval Reformation*, University Park: Penn. State Univ. Press, 2005, pp. 131-132,182,249-251,312,317-318,401 n.87

*Other Late Medieval Writers on Discernment of Spirits*

--"An Early Renaissance Guide for the Perplexed: Bernardino of Siena's *De inspirationibus*," in *Through a Glass Darkly*, New York: Fordham Univ. Press, 1996, pp. 24-49

--Nancy Caciola, *Discerning Spirits: Divine and Demonic Possession in the Middle Ages*, Ithaca, NY: Cornell Univ. Press, 2003

--Rosalynn Voaden, *God's Voices, Women's Voices: The Discernment of Spirits in the Writing of Late Medieval Women Visionaries*, Suffolk/Rochester, NY: York Medieval Press, 1999 (available in Calvin's Hekman Library call no. BV 5091.R4 V62 1999)

**The Rise of Scholastic Theology**

--Ulrich Gottfried Leinsle, *Introduction to Scholastic Theology*, tr. Michael J. Miller, Washington, DC: Catholic University of America, 2010

**Thomas Aquinas' Five Ways**

*The Five Ways*

--Mary T. Clark (ed./tr.), *An Aquinas Reader*, rev.ed., New York: Fordham Univ. Press, 2000, pp. 26,65,104-105,109-110,114-117,160

--Brian Davies, O.P., *Aquinas*, Outstanding Christian Thinkers, London: Continuum, 2002, pp. 38-53, 74-76

-- Brian Davies, O.P., *The Thought of Thomas Aquinas*, Oxford: Clarendon, 1992 (pb. 1993), pp. 21-39

--C.F.J. Martin, *Thomas Aquinas: God and Explanations*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh Univ. Press, 1997, pp. 132-204 (available at Calvin's Hekman Library, call no. B765.T54 M3757 1997)

**Thomas Aquinas on the Atonement**

--Michael Dauphinais and Matthew Levering, *Knowing the Love of Christ: An Introduction to the Theology of Thomas Aquinas*, Notre Dame: Univ. of Notre Dame Press, 2002, pp. 91-104

--Mary T. Clark (ed./tr.), *An Aquinas Reader*, rev. ed., New York: Fordham Univ. Press, 2000, pp. 395-407

--Brian Davies, O.P., *Aquinas*, Outstanding Christian Thinkers, London: Continuum, 2002, pp. 155-157

-- Brian Davies, O.P., *The Thought of Thomas Aquinas*, Oxford: Clarendon, 1992 (pb. 1993), pp. 320-344

--Eleonore Stump, *Aquinas*, London: Routledge, 2003, pp. 427-454 ("Atonement")

**Thomas Aquinas on the Spiritual Life**

--Benedict M. Ashley and Matthew Rzeczkowski (tr./eds.), *Thomas Aquinas: The Gifts of the Spirit. Selected Spiritual Writings*, 2 ed., New City Press, 1995

--Heather McAdam Erb, “ ‘*Pati divina*’: Mystical Union in Aquinas” in Alice Ramos and Marie I George (eds.), *Faith, Scholarship and Culture in the 21st Century*, American Maritain Association, 2002, pp. 73-96 (essential reading to understand Aquinas’ teaching on the spiritual life)

--Jean-Pierre Torrell, *Christ and Spirituality in St. Thomas Aquinas*, tr. Bernhard Blankenhorn, Washington, DC: Catholic Univ. of America Press, 2011

#  **Research and Writing in Theological Studies:**

#  **Some General Guidelines**

 The Church today has an unprecedented need for Christian leaders who can clearly and accurately present the faith. Living in a culture that is aggressively secular, materialistic and inclined to trivialize religious claims, we must be able to articulate and defend the central claims of the Christian faith in a persuasive manner. In the course of our ministries, we will need both to carefully examine controversial issues within the Church and to address the competing claims made by groups outside the Church.

 Theological writing must be carefully structured and critical in nature; a paper that merely summarizes the author’s argument or paraphrases the author’s own words is not acceptable and will not receive a passing grade. The process of researching and writing a theological paper can be broken down into the following steps:

## Before Writing: Critical Reading of the Assigned Text and Note-Taking

Start reading the assigned text(s) four weeks before the assignment is due. While reading the text, take careful notes, being sure to

* identify the most important issue(s) at stake in the reading, the particular position the author is concerned to reject and the specific thesis the author is trying to defend, e.g.

“In his *Commentary on Galatians*, Luther focused on the issue of justification by faith. Luther rejected the medieval Catholic view that one could be reconciled to God only when so much grace had been infused into one’s soul that one merited the favor of God. Drawing on arguments advanced by Paul in Romans and Galatians, Luther argued that while one was still a sinner, God favorably accepted him and justified him.”

* investigate and carefully define the key terms used by the author, e.g.

“By ‘justification’, Luther means the act by which God moves a person from the state of sin (injustice) to the state of grace (justice).”

* indicate briefly why the author feels that this issue is important and is concerned to defend the specific thesis that he or she is advancing, e.g.

“In discussing the issue of justification by faith, Luther felt that the freedom of the believer was at stake. He believed that the medieval Catholic understanding of justification left the believer constantly in fear as to whether he or she had attained sufficient merit through good works. This, Luther believed, undermined the believer’s confidence that he or she had been liberated from the terrors of sin, death and the Devil and left the believer subject to manipulation by unscrupulous ecclesiastical authorities.”

* outline the principal arguments by which the author tries to support his or her thesis, e.g.

“In support of his thesis, Luther advanced three major arguments.” {Then one would present and explain these three arguments.)

* note the relative strengths and weaknesses of each of the principal arguments advanced by the author, e.g.,

“Luther’s challenge was important because it caused the Church to reexamine Paul’s claim that in justification the human agent ‘does not work but trusts God who justifies the wicked, his faith being credited as righteousness’ (Rom. 4:5 [NIV]). At the same time, by making a sharp distinction between justification and sanctification, Luther left himself open to the criticism that he had failed to appreciate the centrality of good works in Jesus’ teaching and the connection made by Jesus between good works, judgment and acceptance in passages such as Mt. 25.”

* As you read, jot down any questions you may have about the author’s arguments (no need to supply answers to these questions just yet). You will find these questions to be very helpful when you write the paper.
* If you are reading works by more than one author on a particular topic, write down the specific points on which the authors studied agree or disagree; these points can be tabulated under different headings. Why do the authors disagree? Do the authors agree about what the fundamental problem is? If so, why do they offer different solutions? Or do their different responses reflect the fact that they define the problem in a different way and are therefore proposing solutions to quite different questions?
* Carefully note down the bibliographic information (author, work, page number) of any material that you intend to quote or discuss within your paper. This bibliographic information must appear in the footnotes to your paper.

### Developing a Thesis Statement: Structuring the First Paragraph of Your Paper

While you were taking notes on the assigned text, you noted that the author had a specific thesis which he or she was trying to defend. The author stated this thesis at the beginning of his or her work and then offered a series of arguments in support of that thesis.

When you analyze the author’s work, you also will need to develop a specific thesis of your own which you wish to defend and then offer an orderly sequence of arguments in support of that thesis. Your thesis statement should consist of a single sentence and normally will be the first sentence of the first paragraph of your paper. The thesis statement will reflect your considered judgment about the thesis and arguments advanced by the author(s) whose works you are reading. Your thesis statement should not be too broad in scope; make sure that it is sufficiently narrow and well defined that it can effectively be defended within the limits of a short essay. After the thesis statement, you should add three or four sentences which

1. briefly indicate why the topic under discussion is important and should be of interest to the reader and
2. concisely summarize the major arguments you will advance in the paper, showing how you will organize the discussion and indicating the conclusion you will draw.

After you have finished writing the first paragraph, reread the instructions for the assignment to make sure you are clear about what precisely is being required. Verify that the way you have set up the paper in the first paragraph (thesis statement and outline of arguments) answers the question(s) set by the instructor in the assignment.

*Building the Argument: Organizing the Body of the Paper*

Think carefully about what arguments could be given in support of the thesis statement you are trying to defend, jotting them down on a piece of paper. Now rearrange these arguments, putting them in an orderly sequence:

1. Place first the arguments that are most important and most likely to be broadly accepted by readers of diverse backgrounds;
2. Move from a *general* statement of the limitations of the author’s position to show the *specific* difficulties actually arising from the position he or she has embraced. Be sure to provide thorough and accurate documentation, quoting and closely analyzing key passages from the author’s work(s) and citing the relevant bibliographical information (author, work, page number) in footnotes;
3. Does one argument depend upon another? If so, put the latter first.

If you are analyzing the works of more than one author, be sure to carefully compare and contrast alternative points of view, noting similarities and differences in how the various authors understand the problem and work toward a solution.

### Conclusion

In the final paragraph, briefly summarize the major arguments advanced in the paper and conclude by reiterating the thesis statement which you defended in the paper.

### Editing and Proof-Reading

* Read your paper out loud to yourself and rewrite any sentences which are too long, are confusing or sound awkward.
* Check carefully for errors in spelling and grammar and eliminate these before submitting your paper. If English is not your first language, use your word-processing program’s spell-check and grammar to check for errors and then ask a native speaker of English to read your essay.
* Remember that all papers submitted for this course *must* obey the conventions of formal written prose, e.g. one should not use contractions, colloquial expressions, first person discourse, emotional appeals, rhetorical questions, *ad hominem* arguments, unfair generalizations or a melodramatic style of presentation.